

Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock

Annual Report

Community Livestock and Agriculture Project

Grant Number: I- DSF – 8112 – AF

AFG No: 390711

Activity Code: 39327

ACRONYMS

AHDP	Animal Husbandry Development Project	USD	United State Dollar
AWP&B	Annual Work Plan and Budget	VBSE	Village Based Seed Enterprises
BVW	Basic Veterinary Worker	VFU	Veterinary Field Unit
CDC	Community Development Council	YPC	Young Professional Consultant
CLAP	Community Livestock and Agriculture Project		
CPM	Country Program Manager		
DAIL	Department of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock		
DCA	Duch Committee for Afghanistan		
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization		
GA	Grant Agreement		
GoIRA	Government of Islamic Republic of Afghanistan		
HED	Home Economic Department		
ICARDA	International Center for Agriculture Research in Dry Area		
IFAD	International Fund for Agriculture Development		
KM	Knowledge Management		
MAIL	Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock		
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation		
PIM	Project Implementation Manual		
MoFA	Ministry of Foreign Affairs		
MoF	Ministry of Finance		
MoWA	Ministry of Women Affairs		
MRRD	Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development		
NCB	National Competitive Bidding		
NHLP	National Horticulture and Livestock Program		
NPD	National Program Director		
NSP	National Solidarity Program		
PCC	Provincial Coordination Committee		
PMU	Project Management Unit		
PSC	Project Steering Committee		
PST	Project Support Team		
REOI	Request for Expression of Interest		
RFP	Request for Proposal		
RFQ	Request for Quotation		
RIMS	Result and Impact Management System		
RMLSP	Rural Micro Finance and Livestock Support Program		
RIMS	Result and Impact Management System		
SPC	Special Procurement Committee		
SP	Service Provider		

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1: PROJECT DESCRIPTION	4
1.1 INTRODUCTION	4
1.2 PROJECT COMPONENTS	4
1.3 IMPLEMENTATION ARRANGEMENTS	5
CHAPTER 2: KEY PROGRAM DATES	6
CHAPTER 3: PROGRESSES MADE THUS FAR	6
3.1 PROCUREMENT AND FINANCE	6
3.1.1 PROCUREMENT.....	6
3.1.2 FINANCE/EXPENDITURES.....	7
3.2 CLAP OFFICE ESTABLISHMENT	7
3.3 START-UP WORKSHOP	8
3.4 EFFECTIVENESS CONDITIONS	8
3.5 IFAD’S SUPERVISION MISSION	9
3.5.1 SIGNING CONTRACTS WITH SPS	10
STEP1: REVIEWING AND FINALIZING SPS CONTRACTS.....	10
STEP2: GETTING APPROVAL OF THE PROPOSAL REVIEW COMMITTEE.....	10
STEP3: GETTING APPROVAL OF THE PSC	10
STEP4: GETTING APPROVAL OF THE SPC.....	11
STEP5: CONTRACT AWARDING.....	11
3.5.2 MoU WITH MRRD/NSP	11
3.5.3 FAO CONCERN REGARDING CTA PERIOD OF SERVICES	12
3.5.4 STATUS OF TAX EXEMPTION.....	12
3.5.5 RECRUITMENT OF PROCUREMENT ASSISTANT	12
3.6 M&E, KM AND GENDER	13
3.7 RECRUITMENT.....	14
3.8 STUDIES/CONSULTANCIES.....	15
ANNEX1: PROPOSAL REVIEW COMMITTEE MEETINGS-FINAL REPORT	16
ANNEX2: PSC MEETING NOTES	22
ANNEX3: CONTRACT AWARDING CEREMONY NOTES	25
ANNEX4: NOTES ON INTER-AGENCIES WORKSHOP ON DEVELOPING HARMONIZED M&E SYSTEM FOR CLAP	26

CHAPTER 1: PROJECT DESCRIPTION

1.1 Introduction

CLAP is development project of MAIL funded by IFAD. Its grant agreement was officially signed between the government of Afghanistan and IFAD on 8 April 2013. As a whole, the project costs about USD65.5 million over a six year implementation period. Overall objective of the project is to reduce poverty in rural Afghanistan, more specifically, to improve food security of 169500 resource-poor households in selected districts in the provinces of Kabul, Parwan and Logar. The project targets the following three groups:

- Small farmers and livestock-keepers, including the landless and those who lost their livestock and/or aspire to keep livestock or restock;
- Women-headed households;
- Resettled and nomadic Kuchis.

CLAP is designed to boost Agriculture and Livestock productivity. This can be achieved by strengthening capacity of the local communities and local institutions by supporting the construction of small-scale infrastructures and enhancing sustainability of the local institutions. The project assists asset (livestock, equipment, skills etc) creation and introduces a range of technological innovations (improved varieties of wheat, food and forage legumes and vegetables resistant to drought and disease) which will enhance production and reduce cost of production (i.e. using community organization) and improve access to improved services. Additionally the project mitigates risks, improves food, feed and nutritional security of animals directly and humans indirectly and increase income through enhancing livelihoods and resilience against predictable livestock emergencies of pastoralists and agro- pastoralists communities. Finally, the project also aims to reduce gender disparities by increasing the social and economic status of women engaged in these activities.

1.2 Project Components

CLAP has three main components; (1) Community Development (2) Agriculture and Livestock Development and (3) Project Management (see table 1):

Component 1: Community development this component include three sub components (1.1) Productive Infrastructure, (1.2) Institutional Strengthening and (1.3) Gender Mainstreaming and capacity building. This component finances small and medium scale infrastructure schemes as prioritized by communities. Emphasize would be given to infrastructure that offer strong linkages intensity and better yields. The project also provides training and other capacity building activities to strengthen the capacity of beneficiary communities/ community organizations, cooperatives/ Unions and local government agencies staff.

Component 2: Livestock and Agriculture Development consists of three sub-components (2.1) Dairy Development aimed at reducing poverty through enhancing food security with a strong emphasis on women-head household and the vulnerable and marginalized with the rural

communities by introducing appropriate livestock and agriculture practice packages (2.2) Poultry Development expected improving food security and nutritional security and providing viable livelihood options by developing the current poultry system using a participative extension methods, and (2.3) Improved food, fodder and vegetable crops aims at developing and promoting new drought resistant and high yielding improved varieties of wheat, food and forage legumes and vegetables along with best practices.

Component 3: Project Management, Policy Support and Young Professional Program (YPC): under this component PST is established in MAIL responsible for overall management, coordination, monitoring, knowledge management and evaluation of the project. In addition, this component includes YPC program, a special fund to support policy development and a special financing facility to support any activity that requires additional support and/or expanding any promising.

Table 1: Components/sub-components, SPs, Beneficiaries and budget

Component/sub-component	Service Providers	Beneficiaries	Budget (USD million)
Component 1			
1.1 Productive Infrastructures	MAIL and MRRD	86,250 HHs	23.034
1.2 Community Development	MRRD		1.1
1.3 Gender Mainstreaming	MRRD		1.2
Total			25.4
Component 2			
2.1 Dairy Development	FAO	3,000HHs	10.5
2.2 Poultry Development	to be contracted	25,000HHs	5
2.3 Food, Forage, Vegetable	ICARDA	81,055 HHs	8
2.4 Kuchi Development	DCA	20000 KHHs	5
Total			28.5
Component 3			
Project Management	PST/MAIL		11.7
Grand total		169,500 HHs	65.5

1.3 Implementation arrangements

The lead implementing agency is MAIL. To implement the project, a PST, located in MAIL, is established with the mandate of overall implementation coordination and technical support for cross-cutting issues (e.g. gender, knowledge management, M&E, procurement, and fiscal oversight), and for the day-to-day management of the project. Project activities will be implemented by relevant Ministries and SPs (see table 1) selected based on their unique skills and expertise, and their long-established presence and experience in Afghanistan. Project coordination and oversight is mandated to establish (i) a PSC at the national level for national level coordination, policy directions, legislative activities and overall oversight, and (ii) a PCC at provincial level.

CHAPTER 2: KEY PROGRAM DATES

The project was declared effective after signing the GA between the GoIRA and the donor-IFAD and is expected to be implemented over a period of six years upon signing the contracts with SPs. Key program dates are summarized in table 2 as follows:

Table 2: Summary of key program dates

Event	Place	Effective date
Signing of GA between GoIRA and IFAD	Rome Italy	8 Apr 13
Getting MAIL minister appointed review committee's approval on SPs proposals and AWP&B	MAIL, Afghanistan	6 Aug 2013
Start-up workshop	MAIL, Afghanistan	28 Sep 2013
IFAD's no-objection on SPs proposals and AWP&B		2 Nov 2012
PSC's no-objection on SPs AWP&B	MAIL, Afghanistan	27 Nov 2013
SPC's no-objection on SPs proposals and contracts	MOF, Afghanistan	4 Jan 13
Signing contracts with SPs	Kabul, Afghanistan	26 Jan 14

CHAPTER 3: PROGRESSES MADE THUS FAR

3.1 Procurement and finance

3.1.1 Procurement

A. Procurement Planning, Updating filing and Procurement Management

During the reporting period the following procurement related activities have been undertaken:

- CLAP procurement plan of 2013 & 2014 was revised as per the M&E, KM, Livestock and program activities and operations,
- CLAP Procurement plan was shared with MAIL procurement directorate for review and comments, subsequently, incorporated in the MAIL procurement action plan,
- Updated project tracking sheet and shared with procurement directorate,
- Develop standard procurement filing procedure and system within the project,
- SPs contracts reviewed and submitted to the approval of SPC.

B. Procurement of Essential Office Equipments

During the above mentioned period, contracts, through the RFQ procedure, were awarded for procuring of necessary office equipment as follows:

- Carpet for the Office,
- Curtain for the office
- Gas heater for the office,
- Repairing an office for CLAP (panting, carpet, etc),
- Organizing of contract awarding ceremony of CLAP.

D. Procurement of Non-consulting Services,

- Two corolla vehicles were contracted for a 12 month duration through NCB procedure,
- Two corolla vehicles were contracted for 4 month duration through RFQ procedure. The reasons the procurement was split in to two were that the two vehicles were hired for the two consultant doing the Kuchis and VBSEs studies. This was for a period of two months only.

3.1.2 Finance/expenditures

During the second and third quarters of 2013, PST/PMU-CLAP was, on one hand, at a severe need of money for its daily operations, on the other hand, MoF could not help CLAP by giving a short-term loan of USD 200,000.00 as outlined in the GA. After completion of the effectiveness conditions (for details refer to [section 3.4](#)), IFAD disbursed to PST/CLAP an initial advance of USD 1.4 million on 12 Nov 2013. This money was a big support for enabling PST/CLAP to pay pending salaries and procure goods and services as required. Finance/expenditures for the period up to the end of Dec 2013 are given in the following table 3:

Table 3: Finance/expenditure during 2013

Finance during the year/IFAD	Dec 13/USD
Initial Deposit	1,400,000.00
Vehicle, Equipment and Material	13,599.29
Technical Assistance, Training & Studies	3,828.33
Salaries and Allowances	61,113.06
Incremental Operating Cost	12,965.99
Total Expenditures	91,506.67
Balance	1,308,493.33

Note: A detailed financial report would also be prepared and submitted by finance unit.

3.2 CLAP office establishment

Establishment of an effective project office was a prerequisite during the reporting period. Because, on the one hand, CLAP team was getting bigger day by day, on the other hand, the previous RMLSP's office was too small to accommodate staff of both projects. Therefore, the NPD with collaboration of the team focused working intimately with MAIL to find a suitable and sufficient office space where both project teams could be placed. Finally, a well-equipped new office was established where both project teams are now moved in. This is was, however, an transitional arrangement.

3.3 Start-up workshop

IFAD's Start-up mission, led by CPM, took place in the late second quarter of 2013, followed by a Start-up workshop on 28 Sep 2013 in MAIL. The main objective was to officially inaugurate CLAP project, enhance awareness and reach common understanding among all project stakeholders on the project objectives and implementation arrangements, and particularly to clarify role and responsibilities of the PST/PMU and SPs (FAO, ICARDA and DCA).



Figure 1 Start up event

The Start-up workshop was officially inaugurated by MAIL Deputy Minister of Financial Affairs followed by technical discussion organized in different sessions of M&E and RIMS+ Baseline, Livestock Development, Gender Mainstreaming, Financial Management. Technical sessions were led by IFAD's technical experts and participated by MAIL and SPs technical staff respectively. Following the suggestions made by participants, PST/CLAP was able to go for a follow up M&E workshop with the intention to establish a harmonized M&E system acceptable to all project parties including M&E unit of MAIL. PST/CLAP was also convinced to come up with an effective and standard PIM applicable for both projects RMLSP and CLAP simultaneously (*for details refer to sections 3.4 paragraph 6*).

3.4 Effectiveness conditions

According to the provisions of GA, a number of conditions had to be met before the grant to become effective. In addition, the grant agreement imposed a number of specific conditions which are going to be addressed before any withdrawal takes place for financing the project activities. Reference to that, PST/CLAP sustained its efforts to meet the conditions on time through which a door could be opened to start physical implementation of the project. The conditions met during the reporting period are summarized as follows:

- 1). **Special Account:** PST/CLAP tirelessly worked with the ministry of finance in order to open a special account required for the fund transfer from IFAD to MAIL. The account is now fully operating and IFAD has already transferred USD 1.4 million as initial advance.
- 2). **National Project Director:** H. E minister of MAIL, officially promoted RMLSP's program director to the National Programme Director position to direct both RMLSP and CLAP projects. This promotion was based on his success in implementation of the RMLSP during the last four years.
- 3). **Establishment of the PST:** PST/CLAP is now fully staffed by filling the following positions:
 - Project Manager
 - Finance Manager

- M&E Specialist
- Procurement Specialist
- Gender Officer
- Knowledge Management Specialist

For further details on recruitment please refer to [section 3.7](#).

4). **Establishment of the Project Steering Committee:** Working together with relevant departments of MAIL, and with a special support from the minister, this structure was officially established in MAIL. Respective ministries officially introduced their representatives for the PSC. Its first meeting was held on 27 Nov 2013 in order to discuss and ultimately approve AWP&B of SPs.

5). **Establishment of the Provincial Coordination Committees:** A team from CLAP, led by the NPD, made visits of DAILS in the target provinces in August 2013. These visits aimed to brief heads of DAILS on the CLAP and on the importance and relevance of the PCCs establishment with a mandate of operational coordination of the CLAP activities in each target province. These structures are now fully in place.

6). **Program Implementation Manual:** Built on the experience of the RMLSP, PIM was developed for CLAP and adopted by IFAD on 6 Nov 2013. Later on, as per the IFAD recommendation during the Start-up workshop, RMLSP hired an international consultant for a period of two months (Nov and Dec 2013) with the intention to come up with a standard PIM applicable for both projects and to facilitate the work of the staff of both projects by helping define the rules, regulations and procedures that guide the implementation, management, supervision and monitoring of both project activities and allows for better communication and coordination among all the stakeholders and partners involved in the implementation of the projects. Worth noted that, during this period, a QUICK BOOK, for effective financial management, was also procured and installed in the computers of the finance team, and respective staff members were trained on it as well. Now the quick book is fully operating.

3.5 IFAD's supervision mission

IFAD undertook a mission from 21 to 27 Dec 2013. The mission was aimed to carry out annual review of COSOP and to follow-up on the preparatory activities for implementation of CLAP and the additional funding and extension period of RMLSP and status of recommendation of RMLSP mid-term review and supervision missions. The mission accompanied by NPD held meetings with all concerned stakeholder including SPs representatives and MRRD/NSP and ended by a debriefing took place with Javaid Ahmad Qaem, General Director, Planning and Policy of MAIL in order to seek for his immediate feedback and agreement on initial findings, conclusions and recommendations.

The mission found CLAP preparatory activities running in a satisfactory manner, while recommend certain activities that need to be focused further and completed timely so that, practical implementation of the project can be assured as required. The mission recommendations are summarized as follows:

- SPs' contracts have been submitted to SPC for approval. Approval is expected during a week time,
- Further to the agreement on draft MoU between MAIL and MRRD, the mission recommended that related AWP&B shall also be jointly finalized and submitted to IFAD for its concurrence,
- The request of FAO for enhancing the person months for CTA shall be considered by concerned specialist of the IFAD upcoming supervision mission,
- SPT/MAIL shall follow-up with the MoF for early resolution of the taxation issue,
- Taking into consideration of the workload, the mission recommended provision/recruitment of an assistant for the procurement specialist.

3.5.1 Signing contracts with SPs

Signing of contract with SPs was a long way to get in, but a very significant achievement of the reporting period that was achieved after passing the following steps successfully:

Step1: Reviewing and finalizing SPs contracts

Before obtaining SPC no-objection, the drafts SPs' contracts were reviewed by different units of the RMLSP/CLAP, IFAD as well as of the procurement department of MAIL. After getting their feedback and recommendations, the contracts were revised accordingly and got ready to be submitted to the final approval of the SPC together with the SPs proposals and AWP&B.

Step2: Getting approval of the proposal review committee

Although IFAD had singled sourced SPs (FAO, ICARDA and DCA) for implementation of different activities under CLAP, MAIL proposed to establish a committee to review all SPs proposals plus their AWP&B. Hence, H.E. MAIL Minister through an official letter no# 672/10-2-1392 assigned a committee comprised of technical staff of MAIL. The committee met in the following occasions in order to thoroughly review the proposals and the respective AWP&B:

- 22 May 2013-First meeting of the committee in order to discuss FAO and DCA proposals
- 13 July 2013-Second meeting of the committee to discuss FAO and DCA proposals
- 16 June 2013-First meeting of the committee in order to discuss ICARDA proposal

Based on the comments/inputs of the committee, SPs revised their proposals and AWP&B, subsequently; the revised versions were cleared by the committee (*for details refer to the proposal review committee meetings-final report in Annex1*) and recommended to be presented to the approval of PSC.

Step3: Getting approval of the PSC

PSC met on 27 Nov 2013, in order to discuss SPs AWP&B. After thorough discussion and review, the committee agreed to adopt the AWP&B and recommended it to be presented to the SPC for no-objection(*for details refer to the PSC meeting minutes in Annex2*). Prior to be submitted to SPC, IFADs no-objection was also obtained and then submitted to the SPC.

Step4: Getting approval of the SPC

After approval by the proposal review committee and PSC, SPs proposals and AWP&B along with the contracts were submitted to the final approval of the SPC on 14 Dec 2013 and its approval was obtained on 4 Jan 2013.

Step5: Contract awarding

After passing successfully the steps revealed above, MAIL minister signed contracts with FAO, ICARDA and DCA representatives in a high profile contract awarding ceremony held on 26 Dec 2013 in intercontinental hotel, Kabul. H.E minister of MLAL, provincial governors, members of the provincial councils, head of DAILs and representative of various provincial lines departments of Kabul, Parwan and Logar provinces, several parliamentarians, representatives of the SPs, representatives of different programs and projects of MAIL, representative of MoF, and representative of media participated in the event.



Figure 2 H.E. Minister Rahimi is awarding DCA contract

The event was organized in three different sessions. In session first, participants made a look of the exhibits of RMLSP put on display. They highly welcomed RMLSP's achievements that the project had made thus far. The second session was started with an official welcome, followed by a documentary film of RMLSP which was found very interesting and convincing by the participants.

After that, H.E minister of MAIL in his peach welcomed participants and stated in details the objectives and components of the CLAP and acknowledged IFAD for its generous support to MAIL for financing of RMLSP and CLAP. In the third session, contracts were awarded to FAO, ICARDA and DCA (for details refer to contract awarding ceremony notes in [Annex 3](#)).

3.5.2 MoU with MRRD/NSP

Similar to the subsidiary contracts with SPs, getting signed MoU with MRRD for implementation of the component1 of the CLAP is a condition imposed by the GA that needs to be met before any withdrawal is taken place for financing of activities under component1. Hence, a draft MoU was developed in the first week of Sep 2013 and shared with MRRD for comments. At the beginning, NSP program staff was happy with the clauses outlined in the draft MoU. Later-wards, the MoU became an issue between MAIL and MRRD, because, MRRD was much reluctant to accept many clauses in the MoU. It could be sensed that, MRRD was also very unenthusiastic to be an implementing partner for the MAIL project. Because it could see itself much wealthy and highly qualified ministry compare to MAIL. Therefore, MRRD was trying to raise different questions, so that it could put aside MAIL and deal directly with IFAD particularly with regard to the fund request. Finally, this issue was raised with MAIL minister and he advised Planning and Policy and Finance departments of MAIL to review the MoU and advise PST/CLAP to change it accordingly. After that, the MoU was shared with the finance team of MRRD and agreed that, the fund request is going to be processed by MRRD in order to

avoid any technical problem in the future. The new version of the MoU is now signed by MRRD minister and presented to the MAIL minister for signing. Meanwhile, MRRD in consultation of PST/CLAP has been working on preparation of the AWP&B for component1. It is expected to be completed in couple of days.

3.5.3 FAO concern regarding CTA period of services

In a meeting with SPs, FAO pointed out that, the existing CAT would not continue providing services in implementation of the dairy development component of the project. Hence, the 18 month period of services recommended by the proposal review committee (*for details refer to annex I*) would not be sufficient for the new CTA to put in place the system as required. The mission recommended that, the issue can be considered by the forthcoming supervision.

For the time being, the issue is solved. The FAO headquarters through a letter issued by the MAIL minister has been informed that, in case of need, MAIL and IFAD can look at extending the duration of the CTA in the future supervision missions.

3.5.4 Status of tax exemption

Tax exemption remained a burning issue in the reporting period and this was mainly due to different interpretation of the national rules and regulations. The mission recommended that, this should be followed up with MoF for a final solution.

During the reporting period, the issue has been incessantly followed up with MoF through the official channels. MoF through the MoFA asked Afghanistan Embassy in Rome for verification of the GA, and in response, the Embassy confirmed the agreement happened between GoIRA and IFAD. After that, MoF through a committee reviewed and discussed the issue and decided that, the issue, according to the law, should be referred to the decision of the cabinet. Following that, MAIL officially submitted the case to the cabinet for discussion. The Cabinet has also requested MoF and MoFA for providing relevant information in order to support the case to be added to the cabinet meeting agenda for discussion. The letters sent and received are referenced as follows:

- MAIL letter #.2844 date/ 11,03,1392 to MoF, Director General of Revenue dept,
- MoF/Director General of Revenue directorate Letter, 47777 date, 3, 7, 1392 to MoFA,
- MoFA/ Letter# 2243 date /10/07/1392 to Embassy of Afghanistan in Rome/Italy
- President's Office Letter # 8304/13/12/1392 to MoFA and MoF,

3.5.5 Recruitment of procurement assistant

Taking into consideration of the workload, the mission recommended provision/recruitment of an assistant for the procurement specialist. As recommended, the position is announced and will be filled as soon as the HR process allows.

3.6 M&E, KM and Gender

M&E: Suggested during the Star-up workshop, CLAP M&E unit organized a two-day inter-agencies workshop on 8 and 9 Oct 2013 in order to establish a harmonized M&E system for CLAP project. This workshop was aiming to prevent duplication, fill in the gaps experienced before and arriving project parties (MAIL, SPs and IFAD) at complementing each other and identify responsibilities of each party. During the workshop, as recognized during the start-up workshop, participants (MAIL, SPs and rep of Kuchi department in MAIL) discussed and agreed on the following topics which are going to be incorporated in the CLAP M&E system:

- RIMS indicators and revision of Log-frame
- Outreach-direct and indirect beneficiaries
- Monitoring tools and methodology
- Reporting tools and reporting frequencies
- Roles and responsibilities of each party
- RIMS baseline and subcomponents benchmarks

It was expected that, by the end of 2013, CLAP shall have the system fully in place. But it was delayed intentionally. Because, it was too early for the SPs to recruit and bring on board national project managers for their respective components who were supposed to be an active part of the discussion and later on of the implementation. Therefore, CLAP M&E unit planned to train the new project managers including their M&E staff as soon as they are on board (*for details refer to Inter-agencies workshop on developing harmonized M&E system for CLAP notes in Annex 4*).

In addition, during the reporting period, M&E unit extended its support in facilitation of the CLAP Start-up workshop particularly in the sessions of Gender, KM and M&E. Further to undertaking regular monitoring of the RMLSP field activities, M&E has played significant role in relevant ToRs development and YCs trainings. CLAP M&E officer has been taking active part and sometime leading data collection and data entry process of RMLSP.

KM: Although, KM specialist has been hired recently- around three months ago- his contribution to the CLAP KM activities is very significant which are summarized as follows:

- Prepared a quarterly work plan and required action plan for better coordination and implement of the KM activities at central provincial level,
- Participated actively in preparation, organization and facilitation of the CLAP contract awarding ceremony. He prepared and developed CLAP Brochure and Stand Banners for the event. It was unique occasion for increasing people awareness on the CLAP project. Therefore, distribution of Brochure and putting on display of the Stand Banners was of much importance. In addition, he documented and recorded the ceremony and reported,
- Updated the Asia-IFAD portal,
- Prepared short written materials for H.E. Minister's Facebook Page,
- Developed a calendar for the year 1393/2014-15,
- Provided technical support to CLAP manager,
- Supported activities of the two consultant teams hired for conducting studies on Restocking and VBSEs under CLAP project.

Gender: Gender officer has been actively undertaking gender relative activities of both RMLSP and CLAP projects. During the reporting period, even though, a significant part of her time has been spent to monitor RMLSP field activities, she was able to undertake the following tasks for CLAP:

- Draft Gender guideline is developed for both projects. It is going to be translated in English soon, and then to be shared with MAIL and SPs accordingly,
- Preparation of Gender Action plan: During reporting year Gender Action plan and quarterly report had prepared and shared,
- Actively participated in organization and facilitation of the M&E training workshop held by HED/MAIL and FAO on 1-5 Feb2014, participated by several representatives (mostly female) of MAIL and DAIL, home economics officers from 16 provinces and 5+1 YPCs from RMLSP and CLAP respectively. Specific objectives of the training were including:
 - To understand, review and analyze the on-going projects and programs,
 - To monitor the situation, potential issues, key gaps, challenges, and opportunities for better performance in upcoming projects and programs,
 - To build MAIL staff especially women capacity on monitoring tools and the usage of them in the field.
- In addition, she also presented RMLSP and CLAP role in support of gender mainstreaming in the target provinces and willingness of doing work in partnership with other organization being engaged or willing to be engaged in gender mainstreaming,
- She actively participated in and extended her support to the IFAD trainer in the training on gender held on 28 October 2013, as part of the CLAP Start-up workshop. During this session, around 20 staff members mostly female of MAIL and SPs were trained. She also prepared workshop report and shared with relevant entities,
- She contributed in translation of the gender related contents of the CLAP Brochure and also prepared written pieces of gender information to the MAIL news letter published every two months,
- She has been actively engaged in consulting female staff of RMLSP and MAIL in order to identify better ways for using female support fund under CLAP. As a result, a draft concept note is prepared and shared with NPD and CLAP Project Manager for review.

3.7 Recruitment

In reference to the project implementation arrangements and requirements, during the reporting period, the following positions have been filled yet:

PST: (for details refer to [section 3.4 paragraph 3](#))

PMU: In PMU, staff such as Logistic officer, M&E officer, Finance officer, MIS associate, one female YPC and one cleaner have been recruited yet. It is worth noted that, Agriculture Specialist has already been identified. He will join CLAP/PMU as soon as his contract is signed by MAIL minister. Infrastructure officer has also been interview; he will be given offer soon. In

addition, interview for three female YPC positions has been taken and selected candidates will be offered as soon HR process allows.

Consultants: Two consultants (one national and one international) hired for conducting Kuchi study and one national consultant hired to undertake VBSEs study.

Other activities: In addition to facilitation of the CLAP recruitment process, HR officer managed to undertake properly the following tasks during the reporting period:

- Entered all personnel files to MAIL HR database and provided hard copies of personnel files for MAIL HR directorate.
- Registered all staff to MAIL electronic attendance.
- Prepared staff attendance and reported to the finance unit for action.
- Developed PST and PMU organogram as per new PIM requirement.

3.8 Studies/consultancies

Kuchi Study-Assessing Restocking Options: During the reporting period, two consultants; one national and one international hired for a period of 45 working days started from 28 Dec 2013, in order to undertake the study required by the CLAP project design document. The study was aiming at assessing different options of restocking under sub-component of Livestock Development among the Kuchis of CLAP project. The consultants were contracted to be paid based on meeting of the agreed upon deliverables. Field work of study was completed in accordance to the agreed schedule. The first draft report is also received and commented, and the final report is going to be submitted after taking into consideration of the given comments/recommendations from RMLSP, CLAP and DCA.

VBSEs Study: In reference of the project design document, during the reporting period, CLAP assigned a national consultant for a period of 30 working days started from mid Jan 2014 to evaluate 35 VBSEs established by ICARDA and FAO. The study completed and the draft report is submitted to CLAP for comments. This report would be also shared with ICARDA for comments.

RIMS+ baseline survey: As required, RIMS+ baseline survey should be undertaken as earlier as the project field work is started. Therefore, hiring a consultant/or firm should be completed once target villages are selected. Taking into consideration of this basic and the Afghanistan government procurement role and procedures, we could not accelerate; ultimately complete the process before target villages are selected. Therefore, the whole process has been taking ahead step by step so that we match the time when the survey is principally required to be conducted.

So far, REOI is announced, bid opening is conducted and shortlisted companies/firms have been asked for RFPs. It is expected the remaining steps are also completed as soon as village selection is completed.

ANNEX1: PROPOSAL REVIEW COMMITTEE MEETINGS-FINAL REPORT

Background

The Community, Livestock and Agriculture Project (CLAP) is a rural development program of the Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock (MAIL) funded by International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD). Its grant agreement was officially signed between the government of Afghanistan and IFAD on 8 April 2013.

The overall goal of the project is to contribute to reduce poverty in rural Afghanistan. More specifically, the project objective is to improve food security of 169,500 rural households in selected districts in the provinces of Kabul, Parwan, and Logar by increasing agriculture and livestock productivity. This will be achieved by enhancing productive assets, skills, services, technologies, and income opportunities of the targeted beneficiaries (i.e. by introducing appropriate livestock and agriculture technology options, strengthening local capacity, and strengthening some weak areas of value-chain, including linkages with markets). The project also aims at reducing gender disparities by increasing the social and economic status of women engaged in these activities.

With the current capacity gaps within MAIL structure at sub-national level (provincial and district), the project components and activities will be implemented by a combination of Government Ministries (MAIL and MRRD) and Service Providers, three (FAO, ICARDA and DCA) of which have been pre-selected in consensus with MAIL during the design missions. These institutions (SPs) have been selected based on their unique technical skills, expertise, and their long-established presence and experience in Afghanistan.

While the Lead Implementing Agency will be MAIL, the selected SPs will be responsible to implement different component of CLAP detailed as follows:

- a. **Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO)** will implement sub-component 2.1 (Dairy Development).
- b. **International Centre for Agricultural Research in Dry Area (ICARDA)** will implement sub-component 2.3 (Improved Food, Fodder, and Vegetable Crops).
- c. **Dutch Committee for Afghanistan (DCA)** will implement sub-component 2.4 (Livestock Development among the Kuchis).

According to the rules set by the MAIL, SPs are mandatory submitting project proposals of their respective projects to the MAIL. In addition, H. E the minister of MAIL tasked through an official letter no# 672/10-2-1392 a technical committee with the aim to appraise SPs' proposals before they are submitted to the Project Steering Committee (PSC), and then to the Special Procurement Committee (SPC) of Government of Afghanistan for final approval. Therefore, the committee's members met on several occasions in order to perform the task they were assigned for.

First meeting of the committee with regard to FAO and DCA proposals _ 22 May 2013

Minutes of the meeting:

PST/CLAP organized the meeting in order to explain to the committee the objective of setting up such a technical structure and its role responsibilities with regard to the appraisal of the project proposals developed by the Service Providers intended to implement CLAP's sub-components (projects) of their interest. PST/CLAP also ensured that each of the committee's members has the CLAP project document so that they could refer to for getting details on CLAP project's components/sub-components.

Follow up actions:

- PST/CLAP shared with the committee draft proposals of FAO and DCA for their review and comments
- Committee commented on the proposals and through the PST/CLAP shared with FAO and DCA and in return, FAO and DCA gave feedback to the committee respectively.
- A follow up meeting was organized on 13 July in order to perceive what are agreed/disagreed between the committee and SPs thus far

Second meeting of the committee with regard to FAO and DCA proposals _ 13 July 2013**Minutes of the meeting:****Present:**

Committee member	Department
Doctor Faridon	Plan and Policy
Doctor Mohammad Asghar	RMLSP
Mr. Herman	NHLP
Doctor Farouq	Animal Health/AHDP

Details

The committee, as assigned by H.E the Minister of MAIL, met on 13 July 2013 with the aim to technically review the draft proposals of DCA and FAO as pre-selected service providers (SPs) of the CLAP *Sub-components 2.4 and 2.1 projects* funded by IFAD.

Each of the committee members had received for their study and technical reviewing the proposals along with the DCA and FAO's response/feedback about the comments they made to the proposals prior they meet on 13 July. After an open argument on the comments and the respective feedback/responses provided by the SPs, the committee agreed that the proposals should be revised based on the following recommendations respectively:

DCA proposal

Restocking:In general the Kuchi people are trying to be settled in the provinces, because of educating of their children, security reasons, increasing population, decreasing the size of lands among landowners, and probably the majority of Kuchis will be settled in the cities. Therefore, it will be difficult for DCA to implement the concept of re-stocking. By other hand, restocking means free distribution which have never accounted as a durable solution of livelihood among the poor communities. In addition, DCA claims that the carrying capacity of the summer pastures is already close to its limit, so what is the point of restocking if it is counterproductive with the limited pastures? Hence, it is recommended that DCA instead of restocking will seek for another option that would really help the poor Kuchis in securing of sustainable

livelihood, or at least DCA does not concentrate much on restocking and take it as a low scale intervention in comparison of the rest of the project activities.

Based on learned lesson from the failed concept in developing countries “would be wise to stop providing them with fish, but teach them fishing” restocking of animals among the so called weak families of Kochis would be something nice for short term and could be misused by those with background of corruption or even increase irritation in related segments of the society.

Digging of water wells in co-ordination with the Veterinary Field Units (VFU), with their limited use for animal and construction of anti-parasitic stations across the migration route for Kochis, will be a useful investment for a long time perspective.

DCA and conflict resolution: Land and rangeland related conflicts in the project site between the Kochis and settled communities can be a serious challenge and cause of the failure of the project. Therefore, it is recommended that the proposal has some specific thoughts methodology in order to avoid the problem in case any part/activity of the project is faced with at any place within the project area.

Number of beneficiaries: The figures, in Table 1 “Kuchi profile” are very confusing. And also there are certain places in the table which are not really coming under the project area. So, it is recommended that the proposal has some good and clear number of beneficiaries and the target areas.

Sustainable services: DCA has planned to establish VFUs and BVWs and build their capacity for reaching the outcome 1 “Improved access to quality veterinary services of pastoralists and agro-pastoralists (Kuchi Community) through a comprehensive community-based approach”. With regard to this activity, the question is that, how trained Para-vets will carry the veterinary inputs such refrigerators, solar, batteries, equipments, vaccines, medicines and others) from the start point to the end point of pasture? Can we say this is a sustainable activity? Instead of this activity, it is recommended to pay attention towards linking the Kuchis with their closest VFUs.

Considering the negative experiences of MAIL with mobile veterinary service in the past, it is difficult to find justification for purchasing vehicles with related parts and associated costs for providing the mobile veterinary service for Kuchis.

FAO proposal

International Technical Advisor: The senior dairy advisor (just 1 person) costs USD 23,000 per month, which makes in total **10% of the overall proposal budget**. By other hand, the project is basically an extension/expansion of an ongoing successful project. So why the project cannot mostly be run by local staff supported by limited inputs from international consultants /technical advisors which are very expensive particularly in case of a so small budget as US\$10.6 million. Therefore, the committee recommends that the project should recruit a full time International Technical Advisor first at the beginning of the project for one year and then for six months period at any time the project would need him/her necessarily. During his/her assignment the International Technical Advisor must train 1 or 2 qualified afghan to take over his duties after the first year of the project (this should be mentioned in his/her TOR).

HLP dairy component interim report of mail/hlp/WB (June-Aug 2009): FAO is kindly noted that World Bank has rejected these part of the report and refused to make fund available for this project. The main reasons were:

- First, the volume of milk available is in doubt and
- Second, it required of investment of 58 Million \$.

Follow up actions:

- PST/CLAP shared with FAO and DCA the minutes of the meeting in order to know what the committee has recommended based on which they have to revise their proposals. It is worth noted that, PST/CLAP got consent of the committee’s members on the meeting minutes before it is shared with the relevant SPs.
- Both FAO and DCA revised their proposals based on the provision of the aforesaid minutes, and shared with the committee the revised version of their proposals for final endorsement.
- As a result, the committee approved both of the proposals and advised to be taking ahead to next steps.

In addition to the FAO and DCA proposals, PST/CLAP was also required to facilitate technical appraisal of the ICARDA’s proposal by the relevant committee members. Consequently, the relevant members of the committee met on 16 June 2012. It is worth noted that, prior to meeting the committee, each member had received the proposal for their study.

First meeting of the committee on ICARDA’s _ 16 June 2013

Minutes of the meeting:

Present:

Committee member	Department
Mr. Zundigul Zamani	Extension
Mr. Noor Ahmad Popal	Planning and Policy
Mr. Asadullah Battar	RMLSP
Mr. Niels D. Hove	Natural Resources

Details

The committee, as assigned by H.E Minister of MAIL, met on 16 June 2013 with the aim to technically review the draft proposal of ICARDA as a pre-selected service provider (SP) of the CLAP Sub-component 2.3 - Improved Food, Fodder and Vegetable Crops funded by IFAD.

Prior to the meeting on 16 June, SPU/CLAP had shared the proposal with each of the committee members for their study and technical review. During the meeting, we discussed the concerns we had with regard to the proposal. The committee agreed that the proposal should be revised based on the following recommendations:

Coordination: The proposal should have a more detailed description about roles and responsibilities both at the national and sub-national (provincial level and district level) and should include a project organigram which should clearly illustrate linkages and responsibilities of various units/staff who are engaged in the in management, coordination and implementation of the project.

Integration/synergies/partnership: It would also be good if there were some more specific thoughts about its linkage, coordination and synergies with the other 2 components of the CLAP and the 3 sub-components of Component 2, i.e. the Dairy Development, Poultry Development and Livestock Development among the Kutchi sub-components. It is also recommended that ICARDA meets with other SPs for instance FAO, with the aim of creating a mechanism of partnership in order to coordinate the activities of the 3 SPs on the ground. Such a mechanism would create synergy and bring an opportunity for taking advantage of each other's expertise and skills. ICARDA should also coordinate with Component 1 (Community Development, including Productive Infrastructure and Institutional Strengthening) especially on how this component can support ICARDA's seed production in terms of irrigation water.

Monitoring and Evaluation: In the project proposal there is little mentioned about an M&E mechanism. Therefore, it is very much recommended to include a comprehensive M&E mechanism with an associated and specific budget for M&E in the proposal. The M&E plan (Matrix) should also be attached to the project proposal and should include specific details about role and responsibilities as well as a time frame for the various M & E activities.

Gender mainstreaming: The proposal aims to reduce gender disparities and is putting strong emphasis on implementing pro-poor strategies at the field level targeting landless, women and female-headed households. It will adopt an integrated community-based rural development approach with focus on providing productivity enhancement and capacity building complementarities to on-going community level initiatives. This is not easy to do in the field where realities are very challenging. The proposal is not strong on how it will implement gender and equity issues at the field level on a larger scale covering 9 districts of 3 provinces over a 6 years period.

Consequently, it is recommended that the proposal includes a clear gender mainstreaming strategy, including objectives, outputs and outcomes and milestones. More specifically, it is the view of the Technical Review Team that this strategy should make a provision for a Gender and Equity Unit to be established or at least there should be a stronger focus on gender mainstreaming in the proposal including the recruitment of a Senior Female Afghan Rural Sociologist (and not "only" a socio-economist), possibly with 1 or 2 assistants (Afghan) to enable the project to go for the big push at the field level in terms of reducing gender disparities and supporting women and female-headed households. In addition ICARDA has to clearly mention which methods will be used, including the methods through which they will do the wealth ranking and the identification of project beneficiaries

Another question is: How will the poor and women headed House Holds be reached when the proposal primarily focuses on providing assistance to farmers who own land?

Storages: The project intends to upgrade 6 potato and 3 seedstores, but the question is: To what extent, at what capacity and up to what level will this upgrading be done? Experiences in Afghanistan show that simple underground stores are not sustainable and they can only be efficiently used during the colder seasons. When the temperature increases during spring/summer they can't be used to keep agricultural products at a reasonable temperature.

Therefore, the Technical Team recommends that proper and long-lasting storage facilities be constructed which eventually could be turned into modern and well-equipped cold storage facilities instead of upgrading the current and simple storages. Obviously management guidelines should also be developed for these buildings. For instance, how to use them, who will use them, to whom they will be hand over, who will take its ownership, will the storage generate money for later maintenance and keep them working, how we can link them to market?

For the purpose of creating market linkages, it is recommended that the proposal include a market linkage strategy and also recruits Marketing advisor (preferably an Afghan national) who would help to implement the strategy and build the capacity of field staff, communities, producers groups, CDCs etc.

Some risks/threats that should be addressed: Under the strategic issues only four aspects are considered, unfortunately, most important issues such as water for irrigation and pest and diseases threats have totally been ignored. Therefore, the proposal should also discuss these issues and should clearly describe how to address these important constraints or “killer assumptions”.

Overlapping with other components: During the meeting the Technical Team discussed poultry. The Team would like to receive more information about ICARDA’s experience with poultry projects targeting poor and landless female headed households, this includes ICARDA’s strategic approach (pro-poor strategy),

Increase in the number of field staff: 9 districts in 3 provinces cover a very large area. In addition the project includes plenty of activities such as capacity building, training, supervision, monitoring etc. It will be difficult to cover all these activities with only 3 technicians, 3 community mobilizers and 6 facilitators. Consequently, the Technical Team recommends that the proposal increases its national staffing, as follows:

- a) One community mobilizer with an agricultural background per district, 9 in total
- b) One extension worker per district, 9 in total
- c) One agricultural specialist preferably with a research background per province, 3 in total

A clear TOR with reporting responsibilities for all positions in the project proposal including for these additional positions should be included in the proposal.

Government contribution: Further details are required. For instance it is estimated that the Government will contribute some \$142000. Is it in cash or in-kind? How has this calculation been made?

Put more money for the benefit of rural poor: The Technical Team recommends that the budget of the proposal be revised based on the following recommendations:

- a) Presently the targeted districts are secure districts compare to other districts of the country, (the proposal also confirms this). Spending US \$ 170,000 on an armored vehicle might not be necessary. The construction cost for the three country seed stores US 120,000 is less than the armored vehicle cost. Therefore, it is recommended that this budget is carefully reviewed with the aim of spending more funds on implementing pro-poor project activities in the districts.
- b) Overall the budget is as follows (approximate figures): Goods and Equipment: 4%, International Technical Support: 13 %, Training: 6 %, International and National Consultants: 19 %, Program support costs: 27 %, Support and Logistics Staff: 12 % Travel: 2 %, General Operating and Administrative Expenses: 8 %. The total amount spends on technical and logistic support and a consultant (13 + 19 + 12 = 44 %) is too high. We recommend that this money should be decreased to the extent possible and funds reallocate for activities benefiting the poor, landless and the women directly in the field.
- c) The Technical Team recommends that more emphasis is put on creating Afghan ownership, capacity building and longer term sustainability issues. Consequently, we recommend the project should recruit a full time National Project Manager for the whole life of the project (6 years) as well as a full

time high caliber International Agricultural Specialist for 22 months (for year 1 and 2). The International Agricultural Specialist must train 1 or 2 qualified afghan agriculturists to take over his duties after the second year of the project (this should be mentioned in his TOR).

Follow up actions:

- PST/CLAP shared with ICARDA the minutes after approval by all the relevant members of the committee.
- ICARDA revised the proposal based on the provision of the minutes.
- PST/CLAP share with committee the revised version of the proposal for approval
- The committee approved the revised version and advised that the proposal now can be taking ahead for the next steps.

ANNEX2: PSC MEETING NOTES

27 Nov 2013

Chaired by: Dr. Mohammad Arif Amanyar, Director of Animal Husbandry, MAIL
Facilitator: Abdul Latif Zahed (NPD-RMLSP&CLAP) and Shahzar Zadran (Project Manager-CLAP)
Venue: General Directorate of Programmes/MAIL
Time: 10:00am- 12:00pm

Meeting Agenda:

Time	Agenda item	Person/Organization
10:00 am - 10:10am	Welcome and opening	Mohammad Arif Amanyar (Chair person)-MAIL
10:10 am - 10:20am	Objective of PSC meeting	Mr. Abdul Latif Zahed-RMLSP & CLAP/MAIL
10:20 am – 10:35am	An overview of CLAP	Shahzar Zadran-CLAP/MAIL
10:35am – 11:35am	Opendiscussion (AWP&Bs)	Participants
11:35am – 12:00pm	Approval of AWP&Bs	Participants

Meeting Participants

- a. Dr Mohammad Arif Amanyar (MAIL)
- b. Mr. Abdul Rahman Ayoubi (MRRD)
- c. Mrs. Anjuma Naeemi (MoWA)
- d. Ms. Khatera Sadat (MoF)
- e. Abdul Latif Zahed (MAIL)
- f. Shahzar Zadran (MAIL)
- g. Ms. Marina (MAIL)

Details notes

Director of Animal Husbandry of MAIL – as the chair person - officially opened the meeting and welcomed participants. In addition, he stated in brief, importance of the CLAP as a development project

of MAIL and asked for a strengthened partnership among the project stakeholders during the project implementation.

Abdul Latif Zahed talked about the meeting objectives and updated participants on the process designed by MAIL for the approval of the project proposals submitted to MAIL by the service providers (FAO, DCA and ICARDA) for implementation of various sub-components of the CLAP. He also briefed participants on their role and responsibilities as members of the Project Steering Committee mandated by the CLAP designed document and the Financial Agreement signed between the Government of Afghanistan and the donor - International Fund for Agriculture Development (IFAD).

Discussing and subsequently approval of the AWPBs of the SPs was the major agenda item that was presented by the CLAP-Project Manager in concise. Worth noted that, the AWPBs had been shared with the committee members for their review and comments couple of days in advance of the meeting. The information presented to the committee with regard to the AWPBs is incorporated in following table:

Table: AWPBs – 1393/2014

Components	IP	Annual Budget
Component 1		
1.1 Productive Infrastructures	MRRD&MAIL	\$ 3,808,000.00
1.2 Community Development	MRRD	
1.3 Gender Mainstreaming	MRRD	
Component 2		
2.1 Dairy Development	FAO	\$ 2,804,592.00
Major activities: animal husbandry, creation of dairy cooperatives and dairy unions, creation of milk collections center, dairy enterprises development, building women capacity in the dairy sector etc		
2.2 Poultry Development	?	\$ 756,000.00
2.3 Food, Forage, Vegetable	ICARDA	\$ 1,121,705.00
Major activities: adaptive research, establishment and support to VBSEs, participatory demonstrations, capacity development etc		
2.4 Kutchi Development	DCA	\$ 938,000.00

Major activities: access to veterinary services, providing of extension services, access to markets, livelihood development, restocking etc		
Component 3		
Project Management	PST/MAIL	\$ 1,320, 087.00
Major activities: project coordination, technical support, oversight, day to day management, YPCs etc		
Grant total:		\$ 10,748,384.40

The Chairperson and the National Programme Director (NPD) discussed and explained each of the projects/work plans with the participants in details and answered the questions raised by the participants. After a protracted discussion, the members came up with the following recommendation that need to be considered as next steps:

- 1- NSP/MRRD: MAIL and MRR as counterpart ministries are encouraged to enter into an MoU with regard to the implementation of the component 1 as soon as possible. The the final MOU will be sent by NSP/MRRD to MAIL soon
- 2- It is recommended that, NSP/MRRD comes up soon with the required AWPB for the implementation of the component 1;
- 3- Implementing Partners are encouraged for a robust coordination and integration among the different components as well as with other development interventions/projects in the targets provinces particularly national programs like AREDP of MRRD
- 4- One of the concerned raised by the meeting members was on the single sourcing of the contracts by IFAD to FAO, ICARDA and DCA. It was, however, suggested that the minister or deputy minister shall be consulted so that single sourcing does not become an issue later. It was decided that the MAIL will be consulted first. After the contracts will and required documents will be sent to Special Procurement Commission for approval. If Special Procurement Commission which includes minster of justice approves the contract then PSC will have no objection.

Action of the Program steering committee:

- **The program steering committee approves AWPBs of FAO, DCA and ICARDA as stated above effective 27 Nov 2013**, and the recommendations made above will not have any effect on the approval status of the work plans;
- **The program steering committee approves the contract arrangements with the service provider conditions to the clearance of same by the special procurement commission.**
- Recommendations which are related to the implementation of the project will be taken care during the implementation. Moreover, increased coordination with other ministries such as MRRD and MOWA shall be done through the provincial coordination committee or PCC.

Signatures of the program steering committee members:

- h. Dr Mohammad Arif Amanyar (MAIL)
- i. Mr. Abdul Rahman Ayoubi (MRRD)
- j. Mrs. Anjuma Naeemi (MoWA)
- k. Ms. Khatera Sadat (MoF)
- l. Abdul Latif Zahed (MAIL)
- m. Shahzar Zadran (MAIL)

ANNEX3: CONTRACT AWARDING CEREMONY NOTES

INTRODUCTION

Rural Microfinance and Livestock Support Program (RMLSP) and Community Livestock and Agriculture Project (CLAP) are development programs of the Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock (MAIL) funded by the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD). The overall goal of these programs is to reduce poverty and vulnerability, and improve food security in the targeted provinces of Afghanistan. The implementation of RMLSP is going on whereas CLAP is just launched by awarding contracts to the service providers (DCA, FAO, and ICARDA).

The launching ceremony of CLAP and exhibition of the products and achievements of RMLSP was organized on January 26th, 2014 in the Intercontinental Hotel, Kabul. The purpose was to award the contracts of CLAP components to the service providers and to promote the products and achievements of RMLSP. Participants were relevant government officials, members of parliament, members of provincial councils, representatives of implementing partners, MAIL programs and Media. They acknowledge the development efforts of MAIL and announced their support from implementation of the projects. The International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD) was also appreciated for funding such development project of MAIL.

Picture 1: Participants visit products of the Backyard Poultry Project of RMLSP.

Objective of the Event

This ceremony was organized to officially award the contracts, and launch three components of CLAP, and to promote the products and achievements of RMLSP.

Details of the Event

The launching ceremony of CLAP and exhibition of the products and achievements of RMLSP was planned and organized by Program Coordination Unit of RMLSP and CLAP in coordination with MAIL and the service providers. The event was conducted on January 26th, 2014 in the Intercontinental Hotel, Kabul. Minister of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock, Governors of Kabul, and Parwan Provinces, President of Logar Provincial Council, relevant members of parliament, representatives of various departments of DAILs of Kabul, Parwan, and Logar provinces, representatives of the service providers, representatives of the projects and programs of MAIL, representative of Ministry of Finance, representative of donor and media participated in the ceremony.

The event was organized in three distinct parts: In the first part, the dignitaries and the other participants visited the exhibits that were put on a display by the project team. The exhibit included some of the tangible items of the project such as veterinary kits, medical instruments/tools, project activity models (Atriplex demonstration plots, dairy model, FFS model etc.), chicken nests (locally made), extension materials etc. They praised and appreciated RMLSP for the achievements the project has made so far

Picture 2: Participants visit Products of the Veterinary Services Project of RMLSP.

In the second part, speakers delivered their speeches. Mr. Mohammad Ismail Sabawoon was the announcer who started the event by inviting Mr. Mohammad Yaqoob to recite some verses from the Holy Qur'an. Afterwards, the participants were invited to watch the documentary film of RMLSP that shows its activities, achievements, and impact.

Subsequently, H.E. Minister of agriculture, irrigation and livestock delivered his speech to the audience. Besides welcoming the participants and describing the purpose, components, and activities of Community Livestock and Agriculture Project (CLAP), he acknowledged IFAD for funding RMLSP and CLAP. Governors of Kabul and Parwan provinces, parliament members of Kabul and Parwan provinces, and head of the Logar provincial council were, respectively, the next speakers. All of them appreciated the development activities of MAIL, and announced their support from the implementation of CLAP in the targeted areas of their relevant provinces. They also thanked IFAD for funding such development projects of MAIL and taking active part in the agricultural development of the country.

Picture 3: H.E. Minister of Agriculture, Irrigation, and Livestock during His Speech.

In the third part, contracts were awarded to the services providers. The contract of Dairy Development Project was awarded to Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (UN-FAO) which was signed by H.E. Minister and the representative of FAO (Mr. Tim Vaessen) on their own parts. The contract of Improved Food, Fodder, and Vegetable Crops project was given to International Centre for Agricultural Research in the Dry Areas (ICARDA) which was signed by H.E. Minister and the representative of ICARDA (Dr. Javed Rizvi) on behalf of their own organizations. Finally, the contract of Livestock Development among *Kuchis* project was awarded to Dutch Committee for Afghanistan (DCA) which was signed by H.E. Minister and the representative of DCA (Mr. Raymond Briscoe) on the part of their relevant organizations.

Picture 4: H.E. Minister and Mr. Tim Vaessen Representative of FAO during Signing of Contract.

The ceremony was well-covered by local media such as TVs and Radios. People from media participated in the ceremony and broadcast the news through their TV and Radio channels. The news was also uploaded on IFAD Asia portal. The event was ended by Minister's press conference and offering of a lunch to the participants. In total there were over two hundreds participants attended the event.

ANNEX4: NOTES ON INTER-AGENCIES WORKSHOP ON DEVELOPING HARMONIZED M&E SYSTEM FOR CLAP

Objective of the workshop

To address start up workshop Joint recommendation of (Gov, IFAD, PST, and SP) and to avoid repetition of errors occurred in the implementation of RMLSP, Program Support team gather with Services providers organized above said workshop to establish M&E system taking in to account the lesson learned during RMLSP. Also the workshop aimed to clear the responsibility of both PST and Services Providers in the implementation of the designed M&E system. Furthermore workshop intended to obtain agreement of SPs on unit for the outreach reporting.

Workshop Proceedings:

Workshop opening and welcoming notes:

The workshop was opened by MR. Shahzar Zadran project manager of the Community livestock and agriculture project He welcomed the participants and mentioned the objective of workshop as well as strongly focused that we should get benefit of this workshop and Suggest lets come to work for a strength M&E system.

Content of the Workshop

- **Identification of RIMS 1st and 2nd level indicator for components**
- **Revision of the existed output and outcomes in the ANWP**
- **Development of monitoring tools**
- **Introduction to Baseline survey and instrument development**
- **Reporting template development**
- **Outreach and identification of outreach unit.**
- **Targeting (wealth ranking)**
- **Best practices recording.**
- **Any other issue.**

Discussion on the above content

Mr. Assadullah Battar Monitoring and evaluation specialist start the presentation and briefly explain the above subject and also all the participants were fully involve in every topic of the content they express their idea and experience which they had from the RMLSP and below is the summary of all discussion which was took place during the workshop.

Results impact management system

How does RIMS fit into the project monitoring and evaluation system?

RIMS are only one part of project monitoring and evaluation, which itself is part of the larger management information system. Because each project operates in a specific context, there will be other elements of monitoring and evaluation that are important to the project, but that are not included in RIMS. RIMS indicators selected by all parties (Gov, PST, SP,) for each subcomponent and soon CLAP will share the draft Log frame.

What is first, second and third level Result?

First-level results measure financial and physical progress; they are mostly quantitative (numbers and percentages, e.g., number of irrigation schemes rehabilitated) and are reported on an annual basis. These indicators are measures of results at either the activity, or output levels of the logical framework (log frame). **Second-level results** measure improved functionality or behavioral change, are more qualitative (e.g., the sustainability of water user associations) and normally take longer to realize. This level corresponds to either the output, or objective level of the project log frame.

Third-level results (impact) measure the combined effects of the first and second level results, are quantitative (e.g., households reporting increased assets) and are measured at three points during project life (benchmark, mid-term and completion). These refer to the goal or objective level of the project log frame.

1. Identification of RIMS 1st and 2nd level indicator for components

From the experience of the RMLSP there was misinterpreted in identification of RMIS indicator. All sp report to RMSLP from their own perception and when RMSLP report to IFAD, afterward IFAD complained that this report not meet our requirement because mostly IFAD focus on outcome and impact of the project so thus CLAP want to bring together RMIS outcome level and impact level indicators.

All participants were shared RIMs guideline and in working groups RIMs indicators were picked up and added to the log frame, see the annex.1

2. RIMs 2nd level indicators:

In the 2nd session of the workshop participants picked up RIMs 2nd level indicators form the RIMS guideline through participatory manner. The RIMs indicators are copied to project log-frame.

3. RIMs 3rd level indicators:

RIMs impact level indicators easily picked up from the RIMs guideline and cited in the log frame.

Revision of the existed output and outcomes in the ANWP

It was agreed When RIMS indicator select from the list of IFAD indicators consequently ANWP need to revision.

4. Development of monitoring tools

- Questioners
- Checklists
- Interviews
- Personal Observations

Actually there are indicators of the Project on the basis of those indicators we make different monitoring tools; they may be the above mentioned tools we can use to collect data from the field. Actually the monitoring is defined like that to gather data from the project area and analysis the data against the indicators.

5. Introduction to Baseline survey and instrument development

The Food and Agricultural Organization defines a baseline study as: “a descriptive cross-sectional survey that mostly provides quantitative information on the current status of a particular situation - on whatever study topic- in a given population. It aims at quantifying the distribution of certain variables in a study population at one point in time. (FAO, 2013)”

- Importance of Baseline studies

Baselines surveys are important for any project for the following reasons:

- ✓ It is a starting point for a project
- ✓ Establishing priority areas/planning
- ✓ Attribution
- ✓ Baseline tools are used for evaluation
- ✓ Donor requirement

Mostly IFAD do Baseline Survey for RIMS indicators on an external consultant or on a firm but SP also have a baseline survey for their common indicator which was discussed in workshop widely and PST should guide them if they need guide. Mostly ifad funded project use the Questioners’ as Survey instrument.

6. Reporting template development.

CLAP, MAIL M&E, Kuchi Directorate, SP agreed that reporting frequency should be as follow,

- Three month
- Six month
- Annual report

And report should be share with related government department because before RMLSP has the miss communication with government now this issue has been clear

7. Outreach and identification of outreach unit.

Direct beneficiaries, spontaneous adopters, indirect beneficiaries

One of the lessons learnt of the RMLSP regarding M&E is the definition of direct beneficiaries and the methodology to calculate it. The issue of spontaneous adopter to be included as direct beneficiaries was also discussed.

8. Targeting (wealth ranking)

CALP will report at the end of the project number of people bring out of poverty therefore it was discussed with participants to come up with solid wealth ranking criteria. Taking in to account the targeting criteria of the component is differ to other and each sub component will target specific residents, therefore it was agreed that a consultancy meeting have to organized with CDC member and translate sub components targeting criteria in to very poor, poor and well of HHs. It was cleared that we might miss the one of the above said level in our beneficiaries.

9. Best practices recording.

Although we initiated number of good practices in the implementation of RMLSP and the result was very satisfying, while we on the other there was lack of proper documentation

To avoid such kind of errors, we have to document our best practice. CLAP will also organize KM training at last week of October, which will be addressed by international Consultant, and your participation is highly appreciated.

10. Agreed actions: The following table shows agreed actions towards recommendations as were discussed in the M&E workshop:

s/no	Agreed action	Resp.	Agreed date	Statues
1	Those people will be counted as direct beneficiaries that being selected by the SP and avail 80% of the project intervention such as provision of inputs, capacity building, access to animal health, and advisory services meanwhile those people will be called none beneficiaries that get benefit from the animal health, or advisory services taking into account the type of services provided by the project. Also those villagers that avail improved seed produced by selected seed producers will be counted as in direct beneficiaries.	PST, SP, Gov,	09 oct, 2013	This has been defined
2	RIMS and common indicators All the RIMS and common indicators will be placed in project log frame, and the revised draft version of log frame IFAD for Final approval. Also SPs have to copy RIMS indicators to their components log-frame and ANWP&B along with common indicators. Also it was cleared that those RIMS indicators that has * have to be reported disaggregated by gender, (male and female)	SP ,PST		Ongoing
3	Project implementation report, Service Provider must report to CLAP and Government quarterly, six monthly and annually along with monthly report.	SP,IP	09,oct,2013	This issue has been clear by all parties during the workshop on 09 Oct 2013

4	CLAP is responsible for the execution of RIMs plus baseline survey with support from SP, while each SP has to conduct Baseline Survey to establish benchmark for respective components mean while CLAP will provide advisory support	SP, IP , PST	09,Oct,2013	Clear
5	CLAP is responsible for the commencement of Annual Outcome Survey and regular monitoring visits to field and SPs will facilitate the process. CLAP has to share AOS questionnaire with relevant SP prior to leave for the implementation of the AOS.	PST,SP,IP	09,Oct, 2013	Clear
6	It is agreed that HHs consider unit for a family, community consider equal to Community Development Council (CDCs)	Gov, SP, IP, PST	09,Oct, 2013	Done
7	SPs will share their questionnaire, monitoring tools and amended component wise log-frame with CLAP for finalization.	SPs, CLAP		
8	CLAP and SP to develop target monitoring sheet, through which all targets will be tracked during project tenure	SPs, CLAP		On going
9	After the finalization of the CLAP log-frame, PSU to develop tracking sheet and share with relevant SPs for RIMS data record keeping.	CLAP		Feb,2014
10	It was agreed SPs to report 1 st and 2 nd level RIMS indicators to CLAP on six monthly bases, Each SP to pick up indicators form RIMs reporting template drop down menu relevant to their intervention. Each SP has to report unit of reporting accordingly.	SPs		ongoing
11	CLAP to organize meeting with MAIL M&E department in order to know their reporting requirements, through which PSU will report to mentioned department	CLAP, MAIL ,M&E dept		Jan 2014
12	SPs to record best practices and report success stories to PSU.	SPs		Ongoing

13	CLAP and SPs to monitor and assess gender related issues	CLAP, SP		Ongoing
14	CLAP to conduct poverty score card survey to categorized selected beneficiaries livelihood.	CLAP		ongoing

Conclusion:

The workshop successfully ended on 9nd October of 2013. The participants from MAIL, M&E Director and Kuchi director showed their interest in participating similar workshop. They also want to get responsibilities in project monitoring and implementing, all stakeholders much appreciate the CLAP this effort to unify M&E system.

Note:

As we missed NSP representative in the meeting, therefore it was agreed to organize separate meeting with to share them CLAP requirements.

List of Participant:

S.No	Name	Designation	Organization	Province
1	Nasrullah Bakhtani	HR Director	MAIL	Kabul
2	Kuchi Sahib	Kuchi Director	MAIL	Kabul
3	Lutfullah Rung	Technical office	FAO	Kabul
4	Shahzar Zadran	Program Manager	CLAP	Kabul
5	Dr.Faridon	Field Coordinator	DCA	Kabul
6	Dr.T.Srinors	Technical Advisor	ICARDA	Kabul
7	Ab.Halim Naseri	Field Manager	ICARDA	Nangarhar
8	Hameedullah Momand	M&E Officer	CLAP	Kabul
9	Assadullah Battar	M&E Specialist	RMLSP/CLAP	Kabul